



jekson berdame &lt;jeksonberdame46@gmail.com&gt;

**Fwd: HTS External Review Decision 8465 - Rejection**

1 pesan

**Denni Pinontoan** <dpinontoan6@gmail.com>  
Kepada: jeksonberdame46@gmail.com

7 Oktober 2024 pukul 09.05

----- Forwarded message -----

Dari: &lt;aosis@hts.org.za&gt;

Date: Rab, 29 Mar 2023 13.58

Subject: HTS External Review Decision 8465 - Rejection

To: Mr Charstar Arstilo Rumbay &lt;christar.indotec@gmail.com&gt;

Cc: Jekson Berdame &lt;jekson\_berdame@iakn-manado.ac.id&gt;, Denni H.R. Pinontoan &lt;dpinontoan6@gmail.com&gt;

\*\*\*\*\*

Ref. No.: 8465

Manuscript title: Revealing the meaning of Contextual Christology in the phrase "apo isa elmaseh" and the word "opo" in Minahasa language translation texts

Journal: HTS Teologiese Studies / Theological Studies

\*\*\*\*\*

Dear Mr Rumbay

We thank you for the submission of your manuscript. The peer review process of your manuscript has now been completed and we have reached a decision regarding your submission. I regret to inform you that the journal is unable to publish your manuscript. We hereby release your manuscript from consideration so you may submit it elsewhere.

The editor has agreed that you may resubmit your manuscript as a new submission once you have taken all the reviewer comments into consideration. Submit by 30 April.

Do consider submitting future manuscripts which you believe would be suitable for the journal.

Thank you for your interest in the HTS Teologiese Studies / Theological Studies.

Kind regards,  
Ms De Bod  
AOSIS colleague  
Editorial Coordinator  
Special Issues Unit  
Scholarly Journals Department  
AOSIS Publishing, Empowering Africa through access to knowledge

Tel: +270219752602

URL: website url of journal

reviewing interest: AOSIS colleague

-----  
Reviewer B:

Text not suitable for an academic journal.

The text does not present a clear question and /or argument and has a confusing structure. The author has been careless in many aspects, such as fact-checking, the orthography and the English language, which has many

errors and is sometimes incomprehensible. This all rendered the reading and analyzing a difficult task.

The text is the result of the analysis of translated christian-religious texts. It concentrates on «the phrase 'Apo Isa Elmesëh' in translating the Bible into Tontemboan and the word 'Opo' to refer to Jesus as God in Tombulu». It would have been helpful to mention the analyzed texts right in the beginning: Herrmann (gospel of Matthew in Tontemboan, 1852), Adriani-Gunning and Regar (Bible stories and other religious texts in Tontemboan, 1907) and Tulaar (in Tombulu, 1931). It should also be stated and analyzed more explicitly that all these translations were made by westerners and their assistants, in a colonial context.

Regarding the struggle in the translation process to find the right terms, and trying to reconcile the worldview of Minahasans with monotheistic Christianity, and the place of Jesus Christ in this belief, see N. Graafland Minahasa : negeri, rakyat, dan budayanya /; penerjemah, Lucy R. Montolalu 1991 (1898) and the theories by Wilhelm Schmidt. Important authors are also Kurt Tauchmann (1968) and Paul Renwarin (mentioned in bibliography)

Later in the text (section 4) this encounter between two different cultures, in an unequal power position, is somehow elaborated, but it should have been more explicitly and preferentially earlier in the text. The fragment about the Dutch Bible Society's (NBG) philosophy might also find a place there. Anyway, its name should be mentioned on the first pages, as well as the role of the later LAI (Lembaga Alkitab Indonesia) . The relationship between NZG and NBG is rendered incorrectly: NBG did not send envoys to Minahasa, and its support for NZG missionaries was almost non-existent. (De Kuiper, De Vries)

It is also unclear which was the Bible version on which the translation of the authors such as Herrmann was based. The Statenbijbel? The Martin Luther translation? The ancient Latin version (códex) is implausible, much less the Hebrew and Greek, mentioned later in the text.

It should also be explained why these early religious texts have been selected, and how the situation is today. There are more complete bibles, as is suggested in the sentence «In the New Testament books in the Tontemboan Bible», without reference. (section 3)

Are there contemporary bible translations in Tontemboan or Tombulu?? And in present-day prayers, in the local context, how do Tontemboan and Tombulu people refer to/ address Jesus Christ?

On methodology, «authors as direct participants in the context » is mentioned, but no explanation or further information is given.

The supporting bibliography is very limited and some major works are omitted (see elsewhere in this comment).

If the author wishes to rewrite the article, some additional remarks (not exhaustive):

The fragments by LAI cited are in the English language. It would be expectable that this institute translates mainly into Bahasa Indonesia. So a recommendation would be to include also the Indonesian LAI version in the text.

Names which sometimes have been spelled incorrectly, sometimes correctly: Herrmann, Hellendoorn, Tulaar, Loba-Mkole.

For citations in English in the text, the translator and the original language should be mentioned. (when applicable).

Spelling rules (USA or British) and the formatting of the bibliography has not been considered by this reviewer

correction on bibliography: Hermann, K.T. Si Indjil in Lennas itu, Kele Aipatikem i Mattheus . Amsterdam: Spin and sons, 1852.

See also alphabetical order, letter S.

Some additional remarks:

36. Bosch (2006) and many other authors have noted that ...

55. names for two sub-ethnic groups in Minahasa, northern Sulawesi (Indonesia). Although both identify themselves as Minahasa, ...

58. There are nine sub-ethnic groups in Minahasa: Tontemboan, Tombulu, Tonsea, Tolour or Tondano, Pasan or Bentenan, Bantik, Ponosakan, Tonsawang, and Babontehu.

60. It translates the phrase "Apo Isa Elmaseh" and the word "Opo" and reveals the contextual meaning of Jesus Christ in Minahasa. THIS SENTENCE IS IN THE WRONG PLACE

332-333 «The word 'mount Sinai' needs to be replaced with 'mount Lokon,' the name of a volcano in Tomohon – North Sulawesi, to bring the Bible closer to readers in Minahasa.» Could the author of this MS elaborate on Brake's argument? Does he/ she agree?

Fragment totally rewritten by reviewer because of the abundant and grave factual errors :

«The Minahasa people had had several encounters with the West since the 16th century when the Spaniards first came into this area. In the 17th century, the Vereenigde Oostindische Compagnie (VOC) also visited this area, and they brought Protestant preachers from the Netherlands.

However, Christian missions only became significant after the mission agency Nederlandsch Zendeling Genootschap (NZG), based in Rotterdam, the Netherlands, sent its envoys to the Dutch East Indies, including Minahasa, from the 1820s on . During the VOC period, preachers had been occasionally sent on non-permanent visits to this area . NOTE: THE FIRST NZG MISSIONARIES LEFT FOR SOUTH AFRICA, IN 1798. 1797 WAS THE YEAR OF THE FOUNDATION OF THE NZG IN THE NETHERLANDS. (A.J. LAMPING 1997)

In 1817, Joseph Kam visited Minahasa and the Sangihe Islands and stayed for several months. After Kam's visit, Jan Gerrit Hellendoorn was placed in the town of Manado , as the residency center ?? and only occasionally visited Christians in the mountains.

Protestant Christianity was introduced to the Minahasa people in the inlands with the arrival of two German NZG missionaries (zendelingen), namely J.F. Riedel and J.G. Schwarz, in 1831. This was followed by intensive activities by several other zendelingen until the early 20th century. They opened schools and introduced simple modern medical treatment methods during that time. The Nederlands Bijbelgenootschap (NBG, Dutch Bible Society founded in

1814) translator envoy carried out translating certain Bibles and religious teaching books into Malay and the Minahasa mother tongues LAST SENTENCE SHOULD BE CORRECTED OR EXPLAINED

-----  
-----  
Reviewer D:

#### COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

All comments you enter in this section will be provided verbatim to authors.

13. Summary of major findings and shortcomings?:

14. Major points that must be addressed?

Please provide a numbered list to facilitate responses with the page and/or line numbers and detailed information on specific recommendations.:

15. Minor points or recommended revisions?

Please provide a numbered list to facilitate responses with the page and/or line numbers and detailed information on specific recommendations.:  
-----

---

HTS Teologiese Studies / Theological Studies | <https://hts.org.za> |  
ISSN: 0259-9422 (PRINT) | ISSN: 2072-8050 (ONLINE)

If you require immediate assistance, please contact AOSIS Publishing |  
Tel: +27 21 975 2602 | Support email: [publishing@aosis.co.za](mailto:publishing@aosis.co.za) |  
Business hours are weekdays between 8:00am-16:30pm

Interested in more Theological and Religious Studies research, visit:

- HTS Teologiese Studies / Theological Studies [<https://hts.org.za>] |
- In die Skriflig/In Luce Verbi [<https://indieskriflig.org.za>] |
- Verbum et Ecclesia [<https://verbumetecclesia.org.za>] |
- Theologia Viatorum [<https://theologiaviatorum.org>]

Confidentiality: The information contained in and attached to this email is confidential and for use of the intended recipient. This email adheres to the email disclaimer described on <https://aosis.co.za>